

## Geology

### Early to middle Miocene monsoon climate in Australia: REPLY

D.R. Greenwood, N. Herold, M. Huber, R.D. Müller and M. Seton

*Geology* 2012;40:e274  
doi: 10.1130/G33384Y.1

---

**Email alerting services** click [www.gsapubs.org/cgi/alerts](http://www.gsapubs.org/cgi/alerts) to receive free e-mail alerts when new articles cite this article

**Subscribe** click [www.gsapubs.org/subscriptions/](http://www.gsapubs.org/subscriptions/) to subscribe to *Geology*

**Permission request** click <http://www.geosociety.org/pubs/copyrt.htm#gsa> to contact GSA

Copyright not claimed on content prepared wholly by U.S. government employees within scope of their employment. Individual scientists are hereby granted permission, without fees or further requests to GSA, to use a single figure, a single table, and/or a brief paragraph of text in subsequent works and to make unlimited copies of items in GSA's journals for noncommercial use in classrooms to further education and science. This file may not be posted to any Web site, but authors may post the abstracts only of their articles on their own or their organization's Web site providing the posting includes a reference to the article's full citation. GSA provides this and other forums for the presentation of diverse opinions and positions by scientists worldwide, regardless of their race, citizenship, gender, religion, or political viewpoint. Opinions presented in this publication do not reflect official positions of the Society.

---

#### Notes

## Early to middle Miocene monsoon climate in Australia

D.R. Greenwood<sup>1</sup>, N. Herold<sup>2</sup>, M. Huber<sup>3</sup>, R.D. Müller<sup>2</sup>, and M. Seton<sup>2</sup><sup>1</sup>Department of Biology, Brandon University, Brandon, Manitoba R7A 6A9, Canada<sup>2</sup>EarthByte Group, School of Geosciences, University of Sydney, Sydney, NSW 2006, Australia<sup>3</sup>Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana 47906, USA

Travouillon et al. (2012) challenge our interpretation of proxy records (Herold et al., 2011), citing five points for rainforest at Riversleigh and across northern and central Australia in the early to middle Miocene; points that we refute here.

**(1) Cenogram/body mass distribution patterns**

Travouillon et al. (2009) were equivocal in assigning some fauna sites to open forest or rainforest using cenograms alone, but using cenograms and body mass distribution (BMD) in combination, they interpreted the majority of the Riversleigh sites as rainforest. Yet, their Discriminant Function Analysis (DFA) of the same faunas identified a mix of open forest (2/6) and rainforest sites (4/6) for the early Miocene, and all five middle Miocene sites as open forest. Thus their own data imply a mosaic of habitats in space and time in the Riversleigh area of northern Australia.

**(2) [and (4)] Obligate rainforest taxa/herbivore dentitions adapted to soft-leaved wet forest ecosystems**

The definition of “rainforest” in Australia includes seasonally dry tropical vegetation rich in deciduous trees (Lynch and Neldner, 2000). All types of “rainforest” are rich in soft-leaved taxa and include obligate rainforest vertebrate taxa. The “dry rainforests,” or deciduous vine thickets (DVT), are biogeographically linked to Australian tropical and subtropical rainforests, and not with “hard-leaved” sclerophyll vegetation. They occur where mean annual precipitation (MAP) is 50–150 cm/yr, and are markedly seasonally dry (cf., MAP >200 cm/yr and low seasonality for tropical rainforests) (Greenwood, 1996; Lynch and Neldner, 2000). In saying Riversleigh faunas represented rainforest, Travouillon et al. (2009, 2012) could mean the whole spectrum of Australian “rainforest” from MAP 50 cm/yr to >200 cm/yr.

**(3) “Species diversity comparable with ... rainforest communities in Borneo” / “Diversity could not be maintained ... in narrow strips along rivers or around lakes.”**

Guerin and Hill (2006, and references therein) argued that landscapes with a mosaic of habitats will have more species in total than if one habitat was present. Fossil vertebrates in pitfall cave and limestone pool deposits and other attritional or “death-trap” assemblages are a feature of Riversleigh (Bassarova, 2004). In a landscape with multiple habitats, attritional assemblages will potentially sample vertebrate taxa from each habitat, and so their diversity reflects the mosaic.

**(5) “Frog assemblages of sympatric small bubble-nesting myobatrachids collectively indicating cool, aseasonal, permanently wet conditions.”**

Myobatrachid frogs are a diverse group found in cool alpine settings in southeastern Australia, as well as in arid and semi-arid environments, with some tropical species producing bubble nests (Littlejohn et al., 1993). “Cool, aseasonal, permanently wet conditions” are contradicted by every

line of paleontological data for the Riversleigh area from the late Oligocene to late Miocene (Guerin and Hill, 2006; Travouillon et al., 2009). Myobatrachids at Riversleigh are not evidence of widespread Miocene rainforests.

Travouillon et al.’s claim that “Guerin and Hill (2006) erroneously presumed that all of Riversleigh’s assemblages were Miocene” is false; these authors clearly stated that Riversleigh spanned the past 25 million years (Guerin and Hill, 2006, p. 717–718). The late Oligocene Riversleigh sites were interpreted as open forest or rainforest, depending on site and method (Travouillon et al., 2009). Whereas late Oligocene and Miocene conditions at Riversleigh may have differed, the correspondence between the vegetation (DVT or “dry rainforest”; Guerin and Hill, 2006) and the mammal analysis for the same time period is compelling for accepting the proxies used.

Travouillon et al. (2012) also cited Lake Eyre Basin faunas as evidence for central Australian Miocene rainforests. Extensive proxy data including paleosols from the Lake Eyre Basin and a newly described flora from Lightning Ridge in New South Wales refute this interpretation (Carpenter et al., 2011; Metzger and Retallack, 2010); unless as argued above, seasonally dry DVTs or forests together with more mesic-evergreen riparian and swamp forests were interspersed with sclerophyll communities.

We recognize the uncertainties in paleoclimate modeling, and the basis for our main conclusion is in fact that the simulated climate underestimates MAP by ~20 cm. Even considering this bias, as well as a CO<sub>2</sub> concentration twice that of the present day, widespread rainforest was not simulated (Herold et al., 2011). In summary, based on the diversity of proxies and the application of numerical modeling, we reiterate our conclusion that it is highly unlikely that “rainforest” (i.e., MAP > 200 cm) occupied large tracts of inland Australia.

**REFERENCES CITED**

- Bassarova, M., 2004, Taphonomy of the Oligo-Miocene fossil sites of the Riversleigh World Heritage Area, Australia: *Ameghiniana*, v. 41, no. 4, p. 627–640.
- Carpenter, R.J., Goodwin, M.P., Hill, R.S., and Kanold, K., 2011, Silcrete plant fossils from Lightning Ridge, New South Wales: New evidence for climate change and monsoon elements in the Australian Cenozoic: *Australian Journal of Botany*, v. 59, p. 399–425, doi:10.1071/BT11037.
- Greenwood, D.R., 1996, Eocene monsoon forests in central Australia?: *Australian Systematic Botany*, v. 9, p. 95–112, doi:10.1071/SB9960095.
- Guerin, G.R., and Hill, R.S., 2006, Plant macrofossil evidence for the environment associated with the Riversleigh fauna: *Australian Journal of Botany*, v. 54, p. 717–731, doi:10.1071/BT04220.
- Herold, N., Huber, M., Greenwood, D.R., Müller, R.D., and Seton, M., 2011, Early to middle Miocene monsoon climate in Australia: *Geology*, v. 39, p. 3–6, doi:10.1130/G31208.1.
- Littlejohn, M.J., Roberts, J.D., Watson, G.F., and Davies, M., 1993, 7. Myobatrachidae, in Glasby, C.J., et al., eds., *Fauna of Australia*, v. 2A: Amphibia and Reptilia: <http://www.environment.gov.au/biodiversity/abrs/publications/fauna-of-australia/pubs/volume2a/07-fauna-2a-amphibia-myobatrachidae.pdf>.
- Lynch, A.J.J., and Neldner, V.J., 2000, Problems of placing boundaries on ecological continua—Options for a workable national rainforest definition in Australia: *Australian Journal of Botany*, v. 48, p. 511–530, doi:10.1071/BT97022.
- Metzger, C.A., and Retallack, G.J., 2010, Paleosol record of Neogene climate change in the Australian outback: *Australian Journal of Earth Sciences*, v. 57, no. 7, p. 871–885, doi:10.1080/08120099.2010.510578.
- Travouillon, K.J., Legendre, S., Archer, M., and Hand, S.J., 2009, Palaeoecological analyses of Riversleigh’s Oligo-Miocene sites: Implications for Oligo-Miocene climate change in Australia: *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, v. 276, p. 24–37, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2009.02.025.
- Travouillon, K.J., Archer, M., and Hand, S.J., 2012, Early to middle Miocene monsoon climate in Australia: Comment, *Geology*, e273, doi:10.1130/G32600C.1.